Subject: Re: don't ask don't tell

Posted by reborn on Wed, 12 Jan 2011 14:59:03 GMT

View Forum Message <> Reply to Message

Spoony wrote on Wed, 12 January 2011 08:24 no.

if i'd won the argument, the basis of what supposedly saved his life wouldn't have been lost, it would have been reinforced. he basically said he had faith that his friends/family (he didn't specify but we'll assume that) would have been devastated if he'd killed himself. well, it's undoubtedly true that they would have been, but this isn't a faith-based position. it's an evidence-based position. all the evidence of how families and friends react to their loved ones committing suicide (unless he was terminally ill and in an extraordinary amount of pain, perhaps) is firmly on one side. what saved his life isn't weaker by what i'm saying; it's stronger because it doesn't rely on faith.

Your response assumes his faith is based on evidence. Going out on a limb I would say you made this assumption as you're an atheist, and therefore think in terms of logic and evidence.

It's likely that your assumption is right, but what if it isn't? You take away that faith and he is left with fuck all.

There's a man who I work with who lost a child a year ago. He was devastated and nly carried on living because he had Two other children. I cannot imagine what he must of felt. I probably would end my life if I was in a similar situation, only having the One child, currently. He found Christianity, and this has had a massive positive effect on his attitude. He is ofcourse still sad, but he went from a broken man, to One that can go to work, smile and function as a father to his remaining children.

I am happy to not see him shattered.

Now you may say that the church caught him at his very most vunerable, and preyed on that. For him though, having faith has let him carry on.

Even if it is a lie (which I am not suggesting either way to be honest), surely he is better for the lie?

I'm not so sure that therapy, counselling or other sources would of had the same effect.

My point is that for some people, faith litterally is a life line.