

---

Subject: Re: If a tree falls in the forest...

Posted by [The Elite Officer](#) on Fri, 05 Oct 2007 16:55:03 GMT

[View Forum Message](#) <> [Reply to Message](#)

---

cheesesoda wrote on Fri, 05 October 2007 08:29: razorblade001 wrote on Fri, 05 October 2007 07:09: Cheesesoda, your not getting what I said... of course all that other stuff would still exist (according to most logic anyway)

But a sound is different. I'm talking about using the information in the question, you don't hear the sound, the sound doesn't happen.

I'm betting most people here are probably thinking "Ok, so since no one was around to hear it, if I just imagine what it was like to be there and relate it to the sound of a tree falling, of course it made a sound"

If anyone is thinking like that, your wrong. Your not there, you can't hear it if your not there.

The tree falls down, causing soundwaves to spread out. However, nothing is within the range of the sound waves that are going to hear the sound before it dissipates. If your not in range, you don't here it. There is nothing there to convert the actual wave into a readable sound.

Think of it like an empty bus. The bus still goes to the destination, but without anyone on the bus, no one gets to that destination.

Edit: Why do people keep bringing up "well animals live in a forest"

Cause if your bringing that up, then you don't understand the question. The question says "if NO ONE IS AROUND to hear it"

"No one" means any being that can hear a sound. Since when does "No one" specifically mean "No human?"

Okay, so let's change the question to something parallel to it:

If you blow a dog whistle, and no dog is around to hear it, are you still making a sound?

Yes because there are some dog wisles that people can hear, so if you blow that kind of whisle and no dog is around but a person is, then that person can hear it and then they have heard that wistle.

---